

ACI 447.1R-18

# Report on the Modeling Techniques Used in Finite Element Simulations of Concrete Structures Strengthened Using Fiber-Reinforced Polymer (FRP) Materials

Reported by Joint ACI-ASCE Committee 447



American Concrete Institute  
*Always advancing*



## **Report on the Modeling Techniques Used in Finite Element Simulations of Concrete Structures Strengthened Using Fiber-Reinforced Polymer (FRP) Materials**

Copyright by the American Concrete Institute, Farmington Hills, MI. All rights reserved. This material may not be reproduced or copied, in whole or part, in any printed, mechanical, electronic, film, or other distribution and storage media, without the written consent of ACI.

The technical committees responsible for ACI committee reports and standards strive to avoid ambiguities, omissions, and errors in these documents. In spite of these efforts, the users of ACI documents occasionally find information or requirements that may be subject to more than one interpretation or may be incomplete or incorrect. Users who have suggestions for the improvement of ACI documents are requested to contact ACI via the errata website at <http://concrete.org/Publications/DocumentErrata.aspx>. Proper use of this document includes periodically checking for errata for the most up-to-date revisions.

ACI committee documents are intended for the use of individuals who are competent to evaluate the significance and limitations of its content and recommendations and who will accept responsibility for the application of the material it contains. Individuals who use this publication in any way assume all risk and accept total responsibility for the application and use of this information.

All information in this publication is provided “as is” without warranty of any kind, either express or implied, including but not limited to, the implied warranties of merchantability, fitness for a particular purpose or non-infringement.

ACI and its members disclaim liability for damages of any kind, including any special, indirect, incidental, or consequential damages, including without limitation, lost revenues or lost profits, which may result from the use of this publication.

It is the responsibility of the user of this document to establish health and safety practices appropriate to the specific circumstances involved with its use. ACI does not make any representations with regard to health and safety issues and the use of this document. The user must determine the applicability of all regulatory limitations before applying the document and must comply with all applicable laws and regulations, including but not limited to, United States Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) health and safety standards.

Participation by governmental representatives in the work of the American Concrete Institute and in the development of Institute standards does not constitute governmental endorsement of ACI or the standards that it develops.

Order information: ACI documents are available in print, by download, through electronic subscription, or reprint and may be obtained by contacting ACI.

Most ACI standards and committee reports are gathered together in the annually revised the ACI Collection of Concrete Codes, Specifications, and Practices.

**American Concrete Institute**  
**38800 Country Club Drive**  
**Farmington Hills, MI 48331**  
**Phone: +1.248.848.3700**  
**Fax: +1.248.848.3701**

[www.concrete.org](http://www.concrete.org)

# **Report on the Modeling Techniques Used in Finite Element Simulations of Concrete Structures Strengthened Using Fiber-Reinforced Polymer (FRP) Materials**

Reported by Joint ACI-ASCE Committee 447

Ganesh Thiagarajan, Chair

Jian Zhao, Secretar

Riadh S. Al-Mahaidi\*  
Gangolu Appa Rao  
Ashraf S. Ayoub  
Zdenek P. Bazant  
Allan P. Bommer  
Mi-Geum Chorzepa  
Christopher H. Conley  
Carlos Arturo Coronado

Gianluca Cusatis  
Mukti L. Das  
James B. Deaton  
Jason L. Draper  
Serhan Guner  
Trevor D. Hrynyk  
John F. Jakovich  
Song F. Jan

Ioannis Koutromanos  
Feng-Bao Lin  
Laura N. Lowes  
Yong Lu  
Christian Meyer  
Yi-Lung Mo  
Abbas Mokhtar Zadeh  
Wassim I. Naguib

Dan Palermo  
Guillermo Alberto Riveros  
Mohammad Sharafbayani  
Hazim Sharhan  
Sri Sritharan

## **Consulting Members**

Ahmet Emin Aktan  
Sarah L. Billington  
Johan Blaauwendraad  
Oral Buyukozturk  
Ignacio Carol

Luigi Cedolin  
Wai F. Chen  
Robert A. Dameron  
Filip C. Filippou  
Kurt H. Gerstle

Walter H. Gerstle  
Robert Iding  
Anthony R. Ingraffea  
Hiroshi Noguchi  
Gilles Pijaudier-Cabot

Syed Mizanur Rahman  
Victor E. Saouma  
Frank J. Vecchio  
Kaspar J. Willam

\*Primary author.

The committee acknowledges R. Kalfat for contributing to this report.

*The strengthening of reinforced concrete (RC) members using fiber-reinforced polymers (FRPs) as externally bonded reinforcement has been widely used to enhance the flexural, shear, and axial capacity, or any combination thereof, of structural elements. Although experimental testing has been used predominantly as the sole method of investigation, numerical techniques such as the finite element (FE) method have also been gradually developed*

*to provide predictive models for structural characterization. Well-calibrated FE models have the potential to expand the range of experimental data, provide information on important parameters difficult to measure using experimental instrumentation, and aid in the design of systems requiring complex FRP strengthening where testing may not be possible. This report provides a state-of-the-art review in the area of modeling of FRP-strengthened RC members and provides general guidelines on the best modeling practices that capture the complex phenomenon of concrete cracking and crushing, concrete shear retention, concrete fracture energy, steel-to-concrete bond behavior, FRP-to-concrete interface, FRP debonding failure modes, and FE mesh dependency.*

**Keywords:** bond; fiber-reinforced polymer; finite element modeling; fracture energy; interface; reinforced concrete; shear retention.

ACI Committee Reports, Guides, and Commentaries are intended for guidance in planning, designing, executing, and inspecting construction. This document is intended for the use of individuals who are competent to evaluate the significance and limitations of its content and recommendations and who will accept responsibility for the application of the material it contains. The American Concrete Institute disclaims any and all responsibility for the stated principles. The Institute shall not be liable for any loss or damage arising therefrom.

Reference to this document shall not be made in contract documents. If items found in this document are desired by the Architect/Engineer to be a part of the contract documents, they shall be restated in mandatory language for incorporation by the Architect/Engineer.

ACI 447.1R-18 was adopted and published August 2018.

Copyright © 2018, American Concrete Institute

All rights reserved including rights of reproduction and use in any form or by any means, including the making of copies by any photo process, or by electronic or mechanical device, printed, written, or oral, or recording for sound or visual reproduction or for use in any knowledge or retrieval system or device, unless permission in writing is obtained from the copyright proprietors.

## CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 1—INTRODUCTION AND SCOPE, p. 2**

- 1.1—Introduction, p. 2
- 1.2—Scope, p. 2

**CHAPTER 2—NOTATION AND DEFINITIONS, p. 2**

- 2.1—Notation, p. 2
- 2.2—Definitions, p. 3

**CHAPTER 3—FINITE ELEMENT MODELING APPROACHES FOR FRP-STRENGTHENED RC MEMBERS, p. 3**

- 3.1—Modeling concrete compression, p. 3
- 3.2—Modeling of concrete cracking, p. 3
- 3.3—Defining concrete fracture energy, p. 4
- 3.4—Influence of shear retention factor, p. 4
- 3.5—Effect of bond between steel reinforcement and concrete, p. 5
- 3.6—Modeling of FRP-to-concrete interface, p. 5
- 3.7—Influence of mesh size and element type, p. 6
- 3.8—Modeling FRP sheets and fabrics, p. 7
- 3.9—Calibration of material parameters, p. 8

**CHAPTER 4—EXISTING STUDIES ON THE NUMERICAL MODELING OF DEBONDING FAILURE IN FRP-PLATED RC MEMBERS, p. 8**

- 4.1—Finite element (FE) simulations of debonding failure models for beams strengthened in flexure, p. 8
- 4.2—Modeling of shear-strengthened RC members using FRP, p. 10
- 4.3—Reinforced concrete members strengthened in torsion using FRP, p. 13
- 4.4—Modeling of FRP-to-concrete joints, p. 14
- 4.5—Axially strengthened RC columns using FRP, p. 15

**CHAPTER 5—CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDED MODELING APPROACHES FOR FIBER-REINFORCED, POLYMER-STRENGTHENED REINFORCED CONCRETE MEMBERS, p. 16****CHAPTER 6—REFERENCES, p. 16**

Authored documents, p. 16

**CHAPTER 1—INTRODUCTION AND SCOPE****1.1—Introduction**

Alongside the escalating demand to increase the strength of existing structures, new strengthening technologies have evolved, such as fiber-reinforced polymer (FRP) materials, which can be used as externally bonded reinforcement. Fiber-reinforced polymer is used not only to increase strength, but also to increase stiffness and provide confinement in existing structures. The technology has found significant success in applications to reinforced concrete (RC) and post-tensioned (PT) structures due to the FRP's strength-to-weight ratio, stiffness-to-weight ratio, excellent durability performance, resistance to corrosion, cost-effectiveness, ability to conform to various shapes, and ease of application.

Fibers are most commonly manufactured using carbon, glass, aramid, and basalt, and are produced in the form of loosely woven mats, pultruded laminates, or bars that are applied to structural elements using high-strength epoxy resins (ACI 440.2R). Research has demonstrated that the use of externally-bonded FRP composites can improve the flexural, shear, torsional, and axial performance of concrete members. In spite of their potential benefits, complete fiber use is often not realized due to the occurrence of premature debonding, which can take one of several forms: concrete cover separation failure; plate-end interfacial debonding; intermediate flexural; or flexural-shear, crack-induced interfacial debonding that is otherwise known as IC debonding (Hollaway and Teng 2008), and shear-induced debonding (also referred to as critical diagonal crack (CDC) debonding [Wang and Zhang 2008]). However, debonding failures involve complex mechanisms and remains a subject of research.

Extensive numerical studies using the finite element (FE) method have been conducted to simulate the various modes of FRP debonding (Kotynia et al. 2008). Finite element simulations have the potential to provide a predictive model for structural failure, expand the range of experimental data, and provide information on key phenomena in the absence of experimental data (Zhang and Teng 2014). However, the simulation of FRP-strengthened RC members is numerically demanding due to the complex nature of concrete, as well as the bond between the externally-bonded FRP and concrete and the relative size of the bond critical zone to the overall member size. As a result, a variety of material models and modeling techniques have been introduced by researchers to quantify the concrete material behavior, the bond properties between the concrete and steel reinforcement, and the bond properties between the FRP and concrete resulting in numerical predictions to various degrees of correlation with experimental data.

**1.2—Scope**

This report summarizes the latest research for the FE modeling techniques of FRP-strengthened RC members, and attempts to provide general guidelines and recommendations on the best modeling practices that capture the complex phenomenon of concrete cracking and crushing, concrete shear retention, concrete fracture energy, steel-to-concrete bond behavior, FRP-to-concrete interface, FRP debonding failure modes, and issues related to FE mesh dependency.

**CHAPTER 2—NOTATION AND DEFINITIONS****2.1—Notation**

$A_g$	=	aggregate size
$c$	=	cohesion
$f'_c$	=	compressive strength of concrete
$f_{ct}$	=	tensile strength of concrete
$G_c$	=	shear modulus of concrete
$G_{F_I}^I$	=	Mode I concrete fracture energy
$G_{F_{II}}^{II}$	=	Mode II concrete fracture energy
$G_{F_{III}}^{III}$	=	Mode III concrete fracture energy
$K_{tt}$	=	tangential stiffness of bond slip curve